



# TOWN OF PARADISE

5555 SKYWAY • PARADISE, CALIFORNIA 95969-4931

TELEPHONE (530) 872-6291 FAX (530) 877-5059

[www.townofparadise.com](http://www.townofparadise.com)

June 20, 2019

MUCKROCK

RE: Your Public Records Request #72116-20181742, received June 15, 2019

To Whom it May Concern:

I am writing to you concerning your request for public records that was received on June 15, 2019. The request is for a voluminous amount of Town of Paradise public records. A copy of your request is attached.

Based on the very large volume of public records in your request relating to separate and distinct Town records, the time limit within which to provide the requested public records is being extended by an additional 14 days in accordance with Government Code Section 6253(c).

As such, the Town's response will be due on July 9, 2019.

Sincerely,

LAUREN GILL  
Town Manager

cc: Dwight L. Moore, Town Attorney  
Marc Mattox, Assistant Town Manager

## Volenski, Dina

---

**From:** 72116-20181742@requests.muckrock.com  
**Sent:** Saturday, June 15, 2019 9:47 AM  
**To:** Volenski, Dina  
**Subject:** RE: California Public Records Act Request: Post-Camp Fire Efforts (Town Of Paradise)

Town Of Paradise  
PRA Office  
Town Hall  
5555 Skyway  
Paradise, CA 95969

June 15, 2019

This is a follow up to a previous request:

**\*\* Every response you send or provide (including all responsive records) may be automatically and immediately visible on the MuckRock.com web service used to issue this request. \*\***

This is a follow-up to the Town under the CPRA for the following. Please consider the Town's obligations under City of San Jose v. Superior Court (Smith), S218066 to search or inquire about personal accounts/devices storing public records - which we do explicitly request.

1. the full record of emails/memos/instant/text messages (incl. all attachments) from Nov 8, 2018 to present date of: communications between the Mayor and any officer/employee of BCAG or County of Butte re: the Mayor's 2019 trip(s) to Washington DC.
2. the full record of emails/memos/instant/text messages (incl. all attachments) from Nov 8, 2018 to present date of: communications between the Mayor and any other town council member re: the Mayor's 2019 trip(s) to Washington DC.
3. the full record of emails/memos/instant/text messages (incl. all attachments) from Nov 8, 2018 to present date of: communications between 2 or more town council members (but not the Mayor) re: the Mayor's 2019 trip(s) to Washington DC.
4. the full record of emails/memos/instant/text messages (incl. all attachments) from Nov 8, 2018 to present date of: communications between 2 or more town staff, or 1 or more council members and 1 or more staff re: the Mayor's 2019 trip(s) to Washington DC.
5. any expense records, reports, invoices, reimbursements, receipts or similar re: the Mayor's 2019 trip(s) to Washington DC kept by the Mayor OR sent by the Mayor to the Town, whether or not the Town paid for any of it
6. all written records of topics discussed, talking points, brochures, PowerPoints, reports prepared by lobbyists and other presentations re: the Mayor's 2019 trip(s) to Washington DC, in the possession of the Mayor, Council, or Town
7. records of any instrument used by the Town to inquire of your Council, Mayor, and other staff for the production/existence of the records in #1/2/3/4/5/6, and their responses. If you refuse to provide #7 because such records would not exist until after you receive this request, we will file a further follow-up on a later date.

I would prefer the request fulfilled electronically, if possible. PDFs are preferred for all contents (emails, texts, etc.).

Please send only those records available without any fees - since we have asked for electronic copies, we expect all will be available without fees. Nevertheless, for any records for which you would charge fees, instead of copies, please provide us the (free) statutorily-mandated CPRA determination of what records exist, so we may inspect them in person if we so choose to do so, and notify us of the expected costs if we wished to move forward with copies.

Please provide responsive records on a rolling basis as you approve/redact them for disclosure.

Please cite statutory authority for any records withheld in whole or in part.

Thank you in advance for your anticipated cooperation in this matter.

I look forward to receiving your response to this request within 10 calendar days, as the statute requires.

Sincerely,

Anonymous Person

Filed via MuckRock.com

E-mail (Preferred): 72116-20181742@requests.muckrock.com

Upload documents directly:

[https://accounts.muckrock.com/accounts/login/?next=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.muckrock.com%2Faccounts%2Flogin%2F%3Fnext%3D%252Faccounts%252Fagency\\_login%252Ftown-of-paradise-17602%252Fpost-camp-fire-efforts-town-of-paradise-](https://accounts.muckrock.com/accounts/login/?next=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.muckrock.com%2Faccounts%2Flogin%2F%3Fnext%3D%252Faccounts%252Fagency_login%252Ftown-of-paradise-17602%252Fpost-camp-fire-efforts-town-of-paradise-72116%252F%253Femail%253Ddvolenski%252540townofparadise.com&url_auth_token=AABaIRqT77L0bKmvxRP_qcbNrgw%3A1hcBpM%3ALVssUlyHTYwzbuXDCE0ayo_edSs)

[72116%252F%253Femail%253Ddvolenski%252540townofparadise.com&url\\_auth\\_token=AABaIRqT77L0bKmvxRP\\_qcbNrgw%3A1hcBpM%3ALVssUlyHTYwzbuXDCE0ayo\\_edSs](https://accounts.muckrock.com/accounts/login/?next=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.muckrock.com%2Faccounts%2Flogin%2F%3Fnext%3D%252Faccounts%252Fagency_login%252Ftown-of-paradise-17602%252Fpost-camp-fire-efforts-town-of-paradise-72116%252F%253Femail%253Ddvolenski%252540townofparadise.com&url_auth_token=AABaIRqT77L0bKmvxRP_qcbNrgw%3A1hcBpM%3ALVssUlyHTYwzbuXDCE0ayo_edSs)

Is this email coming to the wrong contact? Something else wrong? Use the above link to let us know.

For mailed responses, please address (see note):

MuckRock News

DEPT MR 72116

411A Highland Ave

Somerville, MA 02144-2516

PLEASE NOTE: This request is not filed by a MuckRock staff member, but is being sent through MuckRock by the above in order to better track, share, and manage public records requests. Also note that improperly addressed (i.e., with the requester's name rather than "MuckRock News" and the department number) requests might be returned as undeliverable.

---

On June 6, 2019:

Subject: RE: California Public Records Act Request: Post-Camp Fire Efforts (Town Of Paradise)

Thank you for your assistance. It appears we have sufficient information on this, so you can cancel the remainder of the request.

If you have already completed the process for any other records, feel free to provide them at your discretion.

**\*\*Note that every response (including all responsive records) you send may be automatically and immediately visible to the general public on the MuckRock.com internet service used to issue this request.\*\***

Thanks,  
Anonymous

---

On June 6, 2019:

Subject:

I am the only one working on the request, documents are still being reviewed and will be made available as soon as possible.

---

On May 30, 2019:

Subject: RE: California Public Records Act Request: Post-Camp Fire Efforts (Town Of Paradise)

They will be, I'm just struggling with technology!

Sent from Mail<<https://go.microsoft.com/fwlink/?LinkId=550986>> for Windows 10

---

On May 30, 2019:

Subject: RE: California Public Records Act Request: Post-Camp Fire Efforts (Town Of Paradise)

Thank you. For those marked not a town record, if you have retained any copies in the Town's possession of those records, we would still expect them to be disclosed per Govt Code 6252(e) including records "prepared, owned, used, or \*retained\*" (emphasis added).

Thanks!

**\*\*Note that every response (including all responsive records) you send may be automatically and immediately visible to the general public on the MuckRock.com internet service used to issue this request.\*\***

---

On May 30, 2019:

Subject: RE: California Public Records Act Request: Post-Camp Fire Efforts (Town Of Paradise)

Attached is the response as a PDF. Pages 3 and 4 have the bolded items.

---

On April 23, 2019:

Subject: California Public Records Act Request: Post-Camp Fire Efforts (Town Of Paradise)

To Whom It May Concern:

Pursuant to the California Public Records Act (CPRA), I hereby request from Town Of Paradise ("agency") the following records. Certain terms are defined within the body of the request.

- Part A: Regarding recovery and debris removal for the Camp Fire (document search dates: between January 1, 2019 and date of receipt of our request, inclusive)

1. traffic/road/route plans for debris removal trucks ("Truck(s)") moving between the 2018 Camp Fire burn scar and landfills or similar
2. live congestion data/maps gathered showing the traffic impact of the Trucks
3. all investigative reports, study reports, after action reports, or other reports (together, "reports") of traffic accidents or spills caused by or involving any of the Trucks
4. all letters/memos/reports/e-mails/SMS/text/chat messages (together, "correspondence") regarding traffic accidents

or spills caused by or involving any of the Trucks

- If you are unable to search for the topic in A4, please search for the following non-case-sensitive query in the full text of the subject/title or body of the message: (("debris" OR "toxic" OR "soil") AND ("spill" OR "accident"))

5. all correspondence received/sent regarding using a single RoE from mobile/RV park owners in place of individual RoEs

- If you are unable to search for the topic in A5, please search for the following non-case-sensitive query in the full text of the subject/title or body of the message: (("park" OR "mobile home" OR "mobile home park" OR "rv park" OR "recreational vehicle") AND ("indemnification" OR "indemnity" OR "indemnify" OR "liability" OR "ROE" OR "Right-of-Entry" OR "right of entry"))

6. engineering plans, feasibility studies, or environmental studies (together, "study documentation") for the debris removal process, including both the Truck routes and the use and selection of the landfills

7. memorialized data sets for pre-Camp Fire road conditions

8. bids, estimates, proposals, requests for bids/estimates/proposals, and executed contracts (together, "contracting documentation") for the debris removal from publicly owned property including the Town of Paradise, Butte County, and State-owned lands, parks, structures, and equipment (together "public property")

9. contracting documentation for cleaning and rehabilitation of public property

10. insurance claims and adjusters' determinations filed for lost or damaged public property

11. contracting documentation for government-organized debris removal and cleanup of private property (the phase 1/phase 2 processes handled via RoE)

12. contracting documentation for tree removal by public agencies or PG&E

13. reports or study documentation for the use or installation of air, ground/soil, or water quality devices installed at the debris removal sites and/or along the Truck routes, or the performance of such tests

14. all test results for the testing devices or tests in A13

15. all administrative/ministerial permits issued by your agency for Camp Fire recovery functions/contractors/sites

- Part B: Certain complaints or correspondence (document search dates: between November 7, 2018 and date of receipt of our request, inclusive)

1. all correspondence received/sent from/to Michael Orr or mentioning "Michael Orr" - including all forwards/replies to such threads

2. all correspondence received/sent from/to about PG&E's cutting down and/or taking trees on private or public property - including all forwards/replies to such threads

3. all correspondence received/sent from/to Miocene Canal Coalition or mentioning "miocene canal" - including all forwards/replies to such threads

- Part C: all records of each of the following code enforcement cases -- including all e-mails/SMS/text/chat messages received/sent containing the identified case ID as a keyword, agenda items, resolutions, ordinances, notices sent/received, appeals, hearing documents, orders, evidence presented, lawsuits filed, documents filed in such lawsuits, items agendized via staff reports or presentations to any Board of Supervisors or City/Town Council or hearing officers, abatement orders, liens, or special assessments (document search dates: between January 1, 2019 and date of receipt of our request, inclusive):

1. the following specific cases: CE18-0806, CE18-0770, CE18-0649, CE18-1248, CE18-0567, and CE18-0647

2. any cases/proceedings/investigations against private properties failing to clean-up Camp Fire debris via the OES or Alternative programs

Note that every response (including all responsive records) you send may be automatically and immediately visible to the general public on the MuckRock.com internet service used to issue this request.

I would prefer the request fulfilled electronically, by attachments, if possible.

For all electronic copies, you have an obligation to provide electronic records in the original format you hold them. Therefore, where emails, text messages, chat logs, or similar are provided, we would like them in a format that provides \*all\* the parts of the record, namely all headers, metadata, attachments, and inline images.

.eml or .msg message formats are best. However, if you convert messages to PDFs or screenshots of iPhone messages,



etc. in order to perform redaction, please ensure you include all headers, metadata, attachments, and inline images when converting; the usual From/To/Subject/Sent headers are not enough. If you withhold parts of e-mail or text records (such as headers) without statutory justification, you may be in violation of the CPRA and we may challenge your response.

Please consider your obligations under *City of San Jose v. Superior Court (Smith)*, S218066 to search personal accounts/devices storing public records -- which we do explicitly request.

Please send only those records available without any fees - since we have asked for electronic copies, we expect all will be available without fees. Nevertheless, for any records for which you would charge fees, instead of copies, please provide us the (free) statutorily-mandated CPRA determination of what records exist, so we may inspect them in person if we so choose to do so, and notify us of the expected costs if we wished to move forward with copies.

Please provide responsive records on a rolling basis as you approve/redact them for disclosure.

Please cite statutory authority for any records withheld in whole or in part.

Thank you in advance for your anticipated cooperation in this matter.

I look forward to receiving your response to this request within 10 calendar days, as the statute requires.

Sincerely,

Anonymous Person

Filed via MuckRock.com

E-mail (Preferred): 72116-20181742@requests.muckrock.com

Upload documents directly:

[https://accounts.muckrock.com/accounts/login/?next=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.muckrock.com%2Faccounts%2Flogin%2F%3Fnext%3D%252Faccounts%252Fagency\\_login%252Ftown-of-paradise-17602%252Fpost-camp-fire-efforts-town-of-paradise-](https://accounts.muckrock.com/accounts/login/?next=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.muckrock.com%2Faccounts%2Flogin%2F%3Fnext%3D%252Faccounts%252Fagency_login%252Ftown-of-paradise-17602%252Fpost-camp-fire-efforts-town-of-paradise-72116%252F%253Femail%253Ddvolenski%252540townofparadise.com&url_auth_token=AABalRqT77L0bKmvxRP_qcbNrgw%3A1hcBpM%3ALVssUlyHTYwzbuXDCE0ayo_edSs)

[72116%252F%253Femail%253Ddvolenski%252540townofparadise.com&url\\_auth\\_token=AABalRqT77L0bKmvxRP\\_qcbNrgw%3A1hcBpM%3ALVssUlyHTYwzbuXDCE0ayo\\_edSs](https://accounts.muckrock.com/accounts/login/?next=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.muckrock.com%2Faccounts%2Flogin%2F%3Fnext%3D%252Faccounts%252Fagency_login%252Ftown-of-paradise-17602%252Fpost-camp-fire-efforts-town-of-paradise-72116%252F%253Femail%253Ddvolenski%252540townofparadise.com&url_auth_token=AABalRqT77L0bKmvxRP_qcbNrgw%3A1hcBpM%3ALVssUlyHTYwzbuXDCE0ayo_edSs)

Is this email coming to the wrong contact? Something else wrong? Use the above link to let us know.

For mailed responses, please address (see note):

MuckRock News

DEPT MR 72116

411A Highland Ave

Somerville, MA 02144-2516

PLEASE NOTE: This request is not filed by a MuckRock staff member, but is being sent through MuckRock by the above in order to better track, share, and manage public records requests. Also note that improperly addressed (i.e., with the requester's name rather than "MuckRock News" and the department number) requests might be returned as undeliverable.

